

Petition for Thorough Investigation and Justice in the Murder of Professor Papiya Ghosh and Ms. Malti Devi.

To:

Shri Nitish Kumar
Honorable Chief Minister of Bihar
Old Secretariat
Patna, Bihar 800 001, India

E-mail: cmbihar@bihar.nic.in, cmbihar-bih@nic.in

We, the undersigned, are petitioning for a thorough investigation and delivery of justice in the heinous and diabolical murders of Professor Papiya Ghosh and her aged domestic help, Ms. Malti Devi, at Professor Ghosh's residence in December 2006 at Patna (Bihar, India).

The double murders were carried out with vicious brutality. As per the local law enforcement agency, the murders took place as a result of the botched robbery. According to the local police officials, a gang of six perpetrators intruded into Professor Ghosh's house and carried out the horrific murders of two unarmed defenseless women and then proceeded to rob the premises. Four of these perpetrators were arrested by the police about two weeks after the murders. However, two criminals also implicated in carrying out the murders and identified by name (Mustaqin and Sanjogi Rai) have eluded arrest for almost nineteen months after the heinous crimes.

There are many unanswered questions about this so called robbery cum murders that went on several hours at a location that is on a major intersection in the a state capital (Patna, Bihar) and more egregiously, literally at a stone's throw from the local police station.

According to criminal jurisprudence, crime is committed against the society and not just against the victim/s. The state represents the society at large. A case (Number 188: State of Bihar vs. Ram Chandra Mahto and others) lodged by the state of Bihar is being heard from time to time in a Patna fast track court (number 5) since the first quarter of 2007. The case has been lodged against RC Mahto. Few of the goods stolen from Professor Ghosh's residence were recovered from the house of Mr. Mahto.

Professor Papiya Ghosh was an erudite scholar and an eminent Historian known nationally and internationally. She made ground breaking contribution to the fields of teaching, researching and publishing her work on the history of pre- and post independent Indian, specifically focused on Bihar. Please visit the web site dedicated to her life and her accomplishments (www.papiyaghosh.com).

Late Prof. Ghosh's aggrieved family members and several members of the academic fraternity (in India, USA, UK, Canada, and Australia) have sent appeals for justice for Prof Ghosh and Malti Devi, since December 2006. Appeals have been made to the following:

1. The President of India,
2. The Prime Minister of India,
3. The Chief Justice of India,
4. The Governor of Bihar,
5. The Chief Minister of Bihar,
6. The National Human Rights Commission,
7. The National Commission for Women, and
8. The Bihar State Commission for Women.

Petitions have also been filed under the Right To Information Act (RTI Act, which has been brought in to ensure transparency in Government functioning).

Regrettably, none of these communications have elicited the kind of response that is consequential in the context of the quest for delivery of justice. Therefore, once again, we are requesting the Honorable Chief Minister of Bihar, Mr. Nitish Kumar, to reinforce the investigation of the heinous crime and bring to justice the persons that were responsible for this violence against Prof. Ghosh and Malti Devi who represent law abiding and honest women citizens of Bihar.

Please take the necessary action and restore the faith and trust of citizens (of Bihar and of the citizens of world who have roots in Bihar) in the institutes of the state, in particular of the Bihar State and of the Republic of India-the largest democracy in the world.

Thank you very much.

Sincerely,

Jaya Ghosh, Ph.D.

Jaya Ghosh, Ph.D.
Cell Technology, Inc.
8980 Old Annapolis Road, Ste L
Columbia, MD 21045

Signatures / Total: 80

<i>#</i>	<i>Name</i>	<i>Comments</i>
1	Dr. Amitabh Mitra	The murder of Papiya Ghosh and Malti Devi is a blot on the present government of Bihar. Although it is too late, but the investigation of the twin murders should be handed over to CBI immediately.
2	Jaya Ghosh	I urge the CM to take the necessary action and ensure that justice is delivered.
3	Gyanendra Pandey	
4	Reshma Nigam	
5	Jaya Vatsyayan	Justice delayed is justice denied
6	shahla ahmad	Papiya was an exceptional historian and to lose a life under these conditions is deplorable and needs to be rectified .We the citizens of India owe her justice. These crimes should not go unaccounted for if we call ourselves a progressive

nation and the largest democracy in the world .We are not living in feudal times.

7	ruby lal	
8	Dipesh Chakrabarty	
9	rochona majumdar	
10	David Ludden	
11	ajay skaria	
12	Dr.Sebanti Ghosh	
13	Manas Roy	Nitishjee, Please take prompt action
14	Keya Sen	All the culprits in these reprehensible double murders must be awarded punishments befitting their crimes. Only then will justice said to have been done.
15	rumjhum biswas	
16	Sheldon Pollock	
17	Saurabh Dube	
18	Amitava Kumar, Writer and Professor, Vassar College, USA	
19	Ishita Banerjee	Papiya was a dear and valued friend. We have been with Tuktuk in her efforts to get justice for the brutal and unwarranted crime. We are with you in this renewed struggle.
20	Gyan Prakash	
21	Debjani Ganguly	
22	Manas Sen	This is the very least that we can expect from the guardians of law and order after having failed to protect an honest and respectable citizen of the state and of the country.
23	KumKum Kumar	
24	Rathindra G. Majumdar	Letters from my side have already been sent to the Chief Minister in this regard. The Chief Minister's help will be gratefully acknowledged.
25	supriya roychowdhury	
26	Gonapragasen Naicker	The Cardinal Principle that separates a State controlled by a Dictatorship and a State that embrace all the values of a Democracy is the Independence of it Judiciary and its Law enforcement

Agencies. In this Heinous crime against Papiya Ghosh and Malti Devi the wheels of justice have ground to a halt. Justice has to be swift . Justice delayed is both an injustice to the victims as well as the perpetrator. So long as the Judiciary drags its feet in this matter aspersions and speculations are going to be rife, and they are going to abound to the detriment of India, Democracy and the judiciary. If the authorities in charge of the investigations have nothing to hide and are not part of a larger conspiracy, and are using Robbery as a smoke screen, it then becomes imperative of the Chief Justice of India to intervene.

- 27 Dr Shaleen K Singh
28 Sekhar Bandyopadhyay
29 Kogi Singh I support this action for justice fully.
30 Anonymous
31 YOGESH KUMAR SINHA The culprits must be booked and punished immediately and there should not be any laxity on the part of investigating agencies.
32 Harish Narang
33 Rajashree Narayan
34 Geoffrey Jackson In 'Leviathen', Hobbes described how Civil Society was instituted to replace the lawless State of Nature. How can such a murder be possible in Civil Society?
35 Prof Amrit Srinivasan
36 Anonymous
37 Dr. Tarlochan Singh Anand
38 Steve Adisasmito-Smith
39 Prabhu R. Nott
40 Indrajit Bhowmick
41 S L Narayanan
42 Gitanjali K Sen
43 Anonymous Please take up the case for fairness sake. Regards

44	Anonymous	This incidence occurred in 2006 . I recollect having acted on this very petition last year in a similar fashion. I wonder why this long delay on the part of the government to act on such a serious case. I do hope and pray that the Hon. Chief Minister would treat this matter with utmost urgency that it duly deserves. Thank you.
45	Utpal Banerjee	
46	Ranjit Kumar Palit	
47	Subir Kohli	It is unfortunate to see that perpetrators of such heinous crimes are not brought to justice by our judicial system. I hope the chief minister will act sensibly and send out a strong message that this state of lawlessness will not be acceptable anymore
48	Deepika Mahajan	
49	Vinayak Sen	The Chief Minister should ensure such barbarism is wiped out of Bihar for good.
50	Pulak Dhar	
51	Sujit Dasgupta	
52	Mrs. Geeta Khetarpal	
53	Biplab Sengupta	I really do not know whether there is any government in Bihar. There cannot be anything more shameful.
54	nadisha gulati	It is very sad that in India we still need to live under such threats and accept these as part and parcel of our lives. I sincerely hope efforts like yet again remind the system of its flaws and achieve justice for members of the Ghosh family and others.
55	R.Srinivasan	In the larger interests of the entire country, Bihar has to set an example and prove that law abiding citizens live in peace.
56	Jayanta K. & Runu Dey	Such indifference in ensuring justice is indeed a national shame. Hope our law enforcers & judiciary did better justice to their respective jobs.
57	Saurav Sen	Papiya Ghosh taught me to be proud to be Indian - yet I can only hang my head in shame after the way the state has so

casually betrayed her and Malti Devi. Their murder and its aftermath have so far made a mockery of the rule of law in Bihar, and exposed the arrogance and hypocrisy of the individuals and institutions that govern on our mandate yet fail us when we need them.

- Honorable Chief Minister, we understand from our friends and public at large, about the good work being done by you and your Government for uplifting common man's status and bringing justice to the mass that remains exploited in the hands of feudalistic individuals of the state. We have high hope that you shall do everything possible to give the criminals of the ghastly murder there dues as per the land of the law. Let Bihar, with rich history of providing leadership to the nation since ages, stand up in memory of the History Professor and through its stern action against criminals make Bihar and particularly Patna a place where each one of us can lead a life without any fear. Let my fond childhood memories about Patna life be saved from being murdered time and again.
- 58** Amitava Choudhury
- 59** Anonymous Yes, I fully support the above petition.
- 60** Rimli Bhattacharya
- 61** S.K.Hazra It is shameful that till date all the culprits have not been convicted under IPC 302 and investigations have not been able solve many unanswered after 18 months.
- 62** Rasan Puveendran
- 63** Anonymous
- 64** Anonymous
- 65** rajen nair The culprit must be given death sentence.
- 66** Anonymous I strongly consider that this petition must be taken seriously & main culprits must be punished & to avoid such incidence
- 67** Banasri Hazra
- 68** Uttara Shahani
- 69** Goutam Saha
- 70** A Bharat Kumar Please take necessary action and restore the faith in Bihar and on Bihar Government
- 71** Dr Colin C Greig As a long time traveller to India, the State of Bihar is well known to be among the most lawless. It would be a demonstration of the intent of the local government , police and judiciary that the perpetrators of such crimes against defenceless women were swiftly brought to justice
- 72** Anonymous Kill a few of the culprits in public to set example to others.
- 73** S. Gopalakrishnan Sir, It is really surprising that the investigating agencies are

yet to book the criminals and get them punished. All the words that we read in the media will be proved wrong and Bihar will not be able to claim that it has come out of Jungle/Criminal Raj if cases like this are not brought to fruition expeditiously. looking forward to some concrete action.

74 Shyamal Chatterji

The heinous murder of such an outstanding scholar, whose vast knowledge could have been shared with the future generations, is so shameful that the youth of Patna University should make this a moral cause because of their loss.

75 Johnny Chiang

76 Asad Alam

77 Pradip K Shome

78 Joya Chatterjee

I am Papiya's elder sister's friend . Papiya was always a little sister to me. I think she deserves justice

79	Anonymous	
80	Varsha Rani	Papiya remained a dear friend for thirty years. She was forced to leave in the most brutal manner. She went in a jiffy but our wait for justice now seems to be unending. When will the culprits be punished? Can her soul find peace ever without justice..

Cc:

The Hon'ble President of India: Mrs. Pratibha Devisingh Patil
(E-mail: presidentofindia@rb.nic.in)

The Hon'ble Vice president of India: Mr. Mohammad Hamid Ansari
(E-mail: vpindia@nic.in)

The Hon'ble Prime Minister of India: Dr. Man Mohan Singh.

The Hon'ble Speaker of the Lok Sabha, India: Mr. Somnath Chatterjee
(E-mail: speakerloksabha@sansad.nic.in)

The Hon'ble Chief Justice, Supreme Court of India: Hon'ble Mr. Justice K.G. Balakrishnan
(E-mail: supremecourt@nic.in)

The Hon'ble Governor of Bihar: Mr. R.L. Bhatia
(E-mail: governorbihar@nic.in)

The Hon'ble Mr. Justice R.M. Lodha
(E-mail: hcpat-bih@bih.nic.in)

Dr. Girija Vyas, Chairperson, National Commission for Women
(E-mail: chairpersonncw@yahoo.co.in)

Ms Lessi Singh, Chairperson, Bihar State Commission for Women

The Hon'ble Ambassador of India to the USA: Mr. Ronen Sen

The Hon'ble Ambassador of USA to India: Mr. David C. Mulford